

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, MAY 24, 2004

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with members Bloomfield Chatterjee, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser, Spraul-Schmidt, Sullebarger and Wallace present. Absent: Kirk

MINUTES

The minutes of the Monday, May 10, 2004 meeting approved as corrected (motion by Sullebarger, second by Raser).

City attorney Dottie Carmen officially swore in Jay Chatterjee as a new member of the Honorable Historic Conservation Board.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1424 MAIN STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a mural on the south elevation of 1424 Main Street, a three story brick Italianate near the corner of Main and Orchard Streets. The south wall is a former party wall exposed when the abutting corner building was demolished. The lower portion of the mural was completed before the owner stopped work pending a COA.

Ms. Cowden said that Dick Rosenthal of Uptown Arts and William Stone a resident of Orchard Street called to express their support for the mural. No one attended the pre-hearing conference. The artist, Douglas Paul Smith circulated a sketch of the mural keyed to color samples.

Ms Cowden indicated that the proposed mural meets the intent of the Over-the-Rhine Historic District Conservation Guidelines. Although there is no specific guideline that directly address murals, there are similarly sized painted signs on neighborhood buildings. The guidelines do state that such party walls of soft brick should be protected by paint in order to prevent further deterioration. Staff recommends the Board approve the requested Certificate of Appropriateness for the mural as an appropriate wall treatment.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Raser), to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1424 Main Street with the following conditions:

1. The mural shall be painted as shown in the attached drawings;
2. The mural shall be maintained as a piece of artwork. It shall not be utilized to advertise a business at this or any other location or be modified to include any type of signage. The only approved lettering is the dated signature of the artist, Douglas Paul Smith; and
3. The mural shall be maintained and retouched as necessary to keep it free from graffiti and in good condition.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 224 W. LIBERTY STREET, OVER-
THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Adrienne Cowden presented the staff report on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all of the windows in the building at 224 W. Liberty St, the former St. Joseph of Nazareth Grade School. The current owner Mr. Gale Smith of the Smith Family Foundation first presented his project to the Board at its April 26, 2004 meeting. At that meeting, the proposal was heard as a preliminary design review. The Board discussed the several design alternatives presented and requested that Mr. Smith provide some additional information when he returned for a formal hearing.

Ms. Cowden indicated that the Over-the-Rhine Historic Conservation Guidelines stipulate that original window sashes should be repaired rather than replaced. The guidelines also provide for consideration of other solutions if the cost of meeting the guidelines is prohibitively high and the alternative is acceptable. Mr. Smith had argued at the April 26, 2004 meeting that repairing the windows was infeasible and that the options presented were the only real economically viable alternatives. Ms. Cowden indicated that Mr. Smith had still not submitted cost estimates for windows that would meet the guidelines, but the current proposal is a significant improvement over what was originally presented.

Ms. Cowden said other issues are unresolved, specifically the treatment of the tripartite window openings located above the main (south) facade and west elevation entrances. Scott Feld, the window contractor, indicated that the windows will be "stacked" in these openings, but no drawings have been submitted.

Gale Smith was present to answer questions from the Board. He said he chose to pursue Alternative D presented at the April 26, 2004 meeting, a bronze aluminum replacement window that fit the width of the openings, but required an infill header. His architect, John Greiwe provided a sketch section of the window installation. He said the existing metal and wood trim would remain. Window contractor, Scott Feld stated that even though a larger, commercial grade window was specified, it would still require a 4" header. Although he provided no specifics, Mr. Feld stated that the cost of a wood replacement window would be "astronomical."

In response to Mr. Kreider, Mr. Greiwe said that the new interior ceiling would be above the head of the new windows. Mr. Kreider also asked about the total cost of the rehabilitation and the portion attributable to the windows, as a basis for determining economic feasibility. Mr. Greiwe responded that a total cost is not yet known, and will depend on the tenant and the amount of fit-up required. He said at this point the plan was to complete the exterior of the building for the lowest cost possible.

Ms. Sullebarger suggested that if the cost is such a concern, the applicant might consider simply repairing the existing windows. Mr. Smith stated that the windows are in poor condition and replacement parts are unavailable, plus he wanted to make the exterior as presentable as possible to a tenant and the community. Ms. Sullebarger commended Mr. Smith for his effort, but was concerned that he had still not been able to assemble the cost figures requested at the first meeting. She said she was uncomfortable making a decision without the requested information.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Raser, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to take the following actions:

1. The applicant shall provide to the Urban Conservator cost estimates for commercial grade aluminum and custom wood windows that fit the existing window openings without jamb extensions and/or headers that demonstrate the assertion, these options are not financially feasible; and:
2. The applicant shall submit drawings and specifications for the tripartite windows located above the main (south) facade and west elevation for review and approval by the Urban Conservator prior to installation.

OTHER BUSINESS

Ms. Sullebarger announced that she has submitted a letter to the Historic Conservation Board informing the Board that she will be moving to Glendale June 4, 2004. She will still be a property owner in Cincinnati until June 15, 2004 and would be pleased to serve on the Board until a replacement was appointed. She said that she enjoyed serving for the past eight years very much. On behalf of the Board, Mr. Senhauser thanked Ms. Sullebarger for her dedication and service and wished her well.

Mr. Chatterjee indicated that he presently has a conflict between his teaching schedule and scheduled Board meetings. He asked that the Board consider changing its regular meeting day to either Tuesday or Thursday, or perhaps Monday mornings. It was agreed that all members will send their schedules to Mr. Forwood and that the issue will be discussed at a future meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser
Chairman

Date